

# **COUNCIL MINUTES**

(EXTRAORDINARY COUNCIL MEETING)

TUESDAY 19 MARCH 2013



## PRESENT

The Mayor Councillor Belinda Donovan  
Deputy Mayor Councillor Frances Stainton

### Councillors:

Colin Aherne	Oliver Craig	Andrew Jones
Adronie Alford	Tom Crofts	Alex Karmel
Helen Binmore	Charlie Dewhirst	Jane Law
Nicholas Botterill	Gavin Donovan	Mark Loveday
Andrew Brown	Rachel Ford	PJ Murphy
Daryl Brown	Marcus Ginn	Caroline Needham
Joe Carlebach	Peter Graham	Harry Phibbs
Michael Cartwright	Steve Hamilton	Sally Powell
Alex Chalk	Wesley Harcourt	Greg Smith
Elaine Chumnerly	Lisa Homan	Matt Thorley
Iain Coleman	Robert Iggulden	Mercy Umeh
Georgie Cooney	Andrew Johnson	Rory Vaughan
Stephen Cowan	Donald Johnson	

### **43. APOLOGIES FOR ABSENCE**

Apologies for absence were received from Councillors Michael Adam, Victoria Brocklebank-Fowler, Ali de Lisle, Lucy Ivimy, Max Schmid and Peter Tobias.

Apologies for lateness were received from Councillors Georgie Cooney, Gavin Donovan and Jane Law.

### **44. DECLARATIONS OF INTERESTS**

Councillor Joe Carlebach declared a significant interest in respect of the special motion as he was a Trustee, Director and member of the Finance Committee of Arthritis Research UK (ARUK). ARUK owned land on the Charing Cross Hospital site. Councillor Carlebach considered that in the circumstances it would be unreasonable to participate in the matter and therefore left the room during the discussion without speaking or voting thereon.

Councillor Frances Stainton declared a significant interest in respect of the special motion as she was a member of the London Committee of ARUK which raised money for the research; she was not a trustee. Councillor Stainton considered that

this did not give rise to a perception of a conflict of interests and, in the circumstances it would be reasonable to participate in the discussion and vote thereon.

#### **45. SPECIAL MOTION**

##### 45.1 Special Motion 1

7.04pm – Councillor Rory Vaughan moved, seconded by Councillor Stephen Cowan, the special motion standing in their names:

“This Council deplores the fact that the Administration has negotiated a deal with Government Health chiefs that will see:

- The A&E at Hammersmith Hospital close;
- The closure of the A&E and most other acute health facilities at Charing Cross Hospital, which will be reduced to 13% of its current size; and
- 60% of the Charing Cross site turned over to property speculators.

It notes that, despite this, the Administration has spent thousands of pounds of taxpayers’ money putting out leaflets and other PR telling people it has saved Charing Cross Hospital. This statement is strongly disputed by local residents, the campaign to Save Our Hospitals and the Opposition.

This Council therefore agrees to commission an independent assessment of these proposals.”

Speeches on the special motion were made by Councillors Rory Vaughan and Stephen Cowan (for the Opposition) and Councillor Nicholas Botterill (for the Administration).

Under Standing Order 15(e) (vi), Councillor Mark Loveday moved, seconded by Councillor Marcus Ginn, an amendment to the motion as follows:

“Delete all after “This Council” and replace with:

1. Recognises that H&F clinicians and the Council have succeeded in influencing the NHS to make radical enhancements to its ‘Shaping a Healthier Future’ proposals for the borough, so that:
  - Charing Cross will be re-built at a cost of £90m and continue to treat 85% of current patients
  - Charing Cross will retain 70% of its A&E capacity and 24/7 admissions
  - Charing Cross will be a consultant led, specialist hospital with vital cancer and social care specialisms
  - Charing Cross will remain an important teaching hospital, with potentially a ‘leading role in Europe’ teaching integrated healthcare
  - Hammersmith Hospital will remain a Specialist Hospital serving 90% of current patients

2. Notes that:

- Clinicians support the concentration of acute services at fewer, better-resourced centres
- Change was inevitable and the new model was the best achievable consultation outcome for Charing Cross and Hammersmith Hospitals
- The reorganisation is expected to save around 130 lives per year

3. Resolves to lobby the NHS to achieve maximum benefits for borough residents from the new model, including:

- The co-location of a range of health providers at Charing Cross Hospital
- The 24/7 emergency department to be appropriately specified and staffed
- Additional investment in the ambulance service to maintain current response times
- The development of supported housing for elderly and disabled residents on the Charing Cross site.”

Speeches on the amendment were made by Councillors Marcus Ginn, Andrew Brown, Georgie Cooney, Harry Phibbs and Peter Graham (for the Administration) and Councillors Elaine Chumnerly, Iain Coleman, Caroline Needham, Michael Cartwright, Lisa Homan and Stephen Cowan (for the Opposition) before it was put to the vote and a roll-call was requested:

FOR

ALFORD  
BINMORE  
BOTTERILL  
BROWN (A)  
CHALK  
COONEY  
CRAIG  
CROFTS  
DEWHIRST  
DONOVAN (G)  
FORD  
GINN  
GRAHAM  
HAMILTON  
IGGULDEN  
JOHNSON (A)  
JOHNSON (D)  
KARMEL  
LAW  
LOVEDAY  
PHIBBS  
SMITH  
STANTON  
THORLEY

AGAINST

AHERNE  
BROWN (D)  
CARTWRIGHT  
CHUMNERLY  
COLEMAN  
COWAN  
HARCOURT  
HOMAN  
JONES  
MURPHY  
NEEDHAM  
POWELL  
UMEH  
VAUGHAN

FOR	24
AGAINST	14
NOT VOTING	0

The amendment was declared **CARRIED.**

Under Standing Order 15(e) (vi), Councillor Michael Cartwright moved, seconded by Councillor PJ Murphy, a further amendment to the motion as follows:

“Delete all after ‘This Council’ and insert:

“calls on the Secretary of State for Health to hold a public inquiry into the deal proposed for the Borough’s hospitals by the Council’s Conservative Administration.””

Speeches on the amendment were made by Councillors Michael Cartwright, PJ Murphy and Stephen Cowan (for the Opposition) and Councillors Mark Loveday and Marcus Ginn (for the Administration), before it was put to the vote and a roll-call was requested:

FOR	AGAINST
AHERNE	ALFORD
BROWN (D)	BINMORE
CARTWRIGHT	BOTTERILL
CHUMNERY	BROWN (A)
COLEMAN	CHALK
COWAN	COONEY
HARCOURT	CRAIG
HOMAN	CROFTS
JONES	DEWHIRST
MURPHY	DONOVAN (G)
NEEDHAM	FORD
POWELL	GINN
UMEH	GRAHAM
VAUGHAN	HAMILTON
	IGGULDEN
	JOHNSON (A)
	JOHNSON (D)
	KARMEL
	LAW
	LOVEDAY
	PHIBBS
	SMITH
	STAINTON
	THORLEY

FOR	14
AGAINST	24
NOT VOTING	0

The amendment was declared **LOST**.

Under Standing Order 15(e) (vi), Councillor Stephen Cowan moved, seconded by Councillor Rory Vaughan, a further amendment to the motion as follows:

“Delete all after ‘This Council’ and insert:

“recognises that there is little public support for the deal agreed by the Conservative Administration and agrees to re-open negotiations with Government health chiefs to get a better health deal for Hammersmith and Fulham residents.”

Speeches on the amendment were made by Councillors Stephen Cowan and Andrew Jones (for the Opposition) and Councillor Marcus Ginn (for the Administration), before it was put to the vote and a roll-call was requested:

FOR	AGAINST
AHERNE	ALFORD
BROWN (D)	BINMORE
CARTWRIGHT	BOTTERILL
CHUMNERY	BROWN (A)
COLEMAN	CHALK
COWAN	COONEY
HARCOURT	CRAIG
HOMAN	CROFTS
JONES	DEWHIRST
MURPHY	DONOVAN (G)
NEEDHAM	FORD
POWELL	GINN
UMEH	GRAHAM
VAUGHAN	HAMILTON
	IGGULDEN
	JOHNSON (A)
	JOHNSON (D)
	KARMEL
	LAW
	LOVEDAY
	PHIBBS
	SMITH
	STAINTON
	THORLEY

FOR	14
AGAINST	24
NOT VOTING	0

The amendment was declared **LOST**.

Speeches on the substantive motion as amended were made by Councillor Peter Graham (for the Administration) and Councillor Rory Vaughan (for the Opposition) before it was put to the vote and a roll-call was requested:

FOR	AGAINST
ALFORD	AHERNE
BINMORE	BROWN (D)
BOTTERILL	CARTWRIGHT
BROWN (A)	CHUMNERY
CHALK	COLEMAN
COONEY	COWAN
CRAIG	HARCOURT
CROFTS	HOMAN
DEWHIRST	JONES
DONOVAN (G)	MURPHY
FORD	NEEDHAM
GINN	POWELL
GRAHAM	UMEH
HAMILTON	VAUGHAN
IGGULDEN	
JOHNSON (A)	
JOHNSON (D)	
KARMEL	
LAW	
LOVEDAY	
PHIBBS	
SMITH	
STANTON	
THORLEY	

FOR	24
AGAINST	14
NOT VOTING	0

The motion as amended was declared **CARRIED**.

9.25pm – **RESOLVED:**

This Council:

1. Recognises that H&F clinicians and the Council have succeeded in influencing the NHS to make radical enhancements to its 'Shaping a Healthier Future' proposals for the borough, so that:

- Charing Cross will be re-built at a cost of £90m and continue to treat 85% of current patients
- Charing Cross will retain 70% of its A&E capacity and 24/7 admissions
- Charing Cross will be a consultant led, specialist hospital with vital cancer and social care specialisms
- Charing Cross will remain an important teaching hospital, with potentially a 'leading role in Europe' teaching integrated healthcare
- Hammersmith Hospital will remain a Specialist Hospital serving 90% of current patients

2. Notes that:

- Clinicians support the concentration of acute services at fewer, better-resourced centres
- Change was inevitable and the new model was the best achievable consultation outcome for Charing Cross and Hammersmith Hospitals
- The reorganisation is expected to save around 130 lives per year

3. Resolves to lobby the NHS to achieve maximum benefits for borough residents from the new model, including:

- The co-location of a range of health providers at Charing Cross Hospital
- The 24/7 emergency department to be appropriately specified and staffed
- Additional investment in the ambulance service to maintain current response times
- The development of supported housing for elderly and disabled residents on the Charing Cross site.

(Councillor Carlebach had declared a significant interest in respect of this item and left the room during discussion of the matter without speaking or voting thereon.)

Meeting started: 7.00 pm  
Meeting ended: 9.25 pm

Mayor .....